Educational Trajectories within the Cluster of E-Commerce at the EU Level

Speranța Camelia PÎRCIOG

National Scientific Research Institute for Labor and Social Protection Povernei 6-8, Bucharest, Romania <u>pirciog@incsmps.ro</u>

Adriana GRIGORESCU

National University of Political Studies and Public Administration Expoziției Bd. 30A, Bucharest, Romania <u>adriana.grigorescu@snspa.ro</u>

Cristina LINCARU

National Scientific Research Institute for Labor and Social Protection Povernei 6-8, Bucharest, Romania <u>cristina.lincaru@yahoo.de</u>

Abstract

The COVID-19 health crisis determined the digital transformation that hybridizes in different shapes and intensities the activities; for example, e-commerce flourished in the last 18 months. Technological change generates "radically new" jobs, and they are demanding new skills. Ecommerce moves in the digital the sales, payment, and orders. The high level of interdisciplinarity of e-commerce melts old commerce with information technologies skills. It creates "new markets, new products, new business models, service innovation for products, customer-centric innovation". (De Propris & Bailey, 2020) While technological progress is faster and faster, occupational mobility is the solution for the resilience of the labor force. Labor market and education systems need to identify, define, standardize and manage new skills and competencies to respond to e-commerce's demands. The paper aims to identify educational trajectories by ISCED level and fields within the cluster of e-commerce using the Spearman correlation. We explore the monotonic relationship between the pairs data of the share of graduates by education (15 areas and five levels of education for the 2013-2018 period) and e-commerce share of enterprises' turnover for the period 2015-2020 by ranks estimation for 27 European countries. The findings were on two dimensions: one pointed specifically toward e-commerce and the other pointing to the general change in the digital transformation through the radical shift in education. The first result shapes the e-commerce cluster profile that maps the "Computer use" covering the entire educational trajectory from ISCED 5 to ISCED 8. The fields "Secretarial and office work" and "Wholesale and retail sales" supplement the cluster but only at ISCED 6 level.

Keywords

Education; training; digitalization; e-commerce; graduates; employability

Introduction

Recently, especially due to the background of the COVID-19 pandemic, e-commerce emerges as distinct sector. The EU 27 share of enterprises' turnover on e-commerce

sales increased in 2020 to 20% from 17% in 2018, with a growth rate of 17.6%. Looking back ten years, this share almost doubled from 12% in 2009. A lot of new technologies coming from ITC sector hybridize the commerce; e-commerce being an example of digital transformation appearance in business and jobs.

E-commerce is to account for Half the Growth in Global Retail by 2025 according to Euromonitor International (Li, 2021). Amazon & eBAy are among the biggest online market places that have in 2019 over 50% for all e-commerce (Foot, 2020). So, the e-commerce is a good example of **digital transformation** "as the process of replacing the traditional business process with digital technologies, to improve, advance or streamline ways of working" (airfocus, 2021). Through digital experience the customer fulfils its personalized experiences in a safer, quickly and efficiently manner.

The digital channel is not only for sales but for research (McAuliffe, 2020) that cover whole globe using online marketplaces (Foot, 2020). On the other side, the seller anticipate that customer needs and its strategy of "e-Commerce customer experience is rapidly becoming the great differentiator" (McAuliffe, 2020). Eurostat defines e-commerce as "sales of goods or services, the order is placed via web sites, apps or EDI¹-type messages by methods specifically designed for the purpose of receiving orders", excluding the orders written in e-mail. Payment may be done online or offline.

High potential of growth and the increased capacity of employment are the main characteristics of e-commerce to be of interest for topics as: Design centered on employer/demand; Horizontal occupational mobility on the background of Educational and Vocational Systems; Digital single market; Digital transformation; Resilience.

On this background our **research question** is: *What are the detailed fields of education and training by education levels correlated with e-commerce increasing?*

Technological progress changes the personal, civic, social and employment-related context. Consequently, the new demand for improving knowledge, skills, and competencies related to e-commerce development needs to radically update or change the occupations and content of requested skills. The new skills demanded by e-commerce has to be identified, defined and operationalized in the education framework in terms of field and level of education.

Our research is a small part of the challenge raised by the profound digital transformation process across all fields of human activity that generates radical structural changes of the economy towards Industry 4.0+ (De Propris & Bailey, 2020). These radical changes are critical issues for human capital management at any age and in all sectors. Clustering the educational trajectories for any education (initial or adult education) is a base for increasing occupational mobility to support intersectoral and intra-sectoral labor force reallocation (Hamiton, 2012). "Occupational clusters have the potential to facilitate skills transferability and cross-occupational mobility. These clusters contain certain elements, such as skills, knowledge, tasks, activities and

¹ Electronic Data Interchange

desirable employee attributes, which are common to 'groups' of occupations across industries" (Snell et al., 2016, p. 10).

E-commerce skills are digital work skills. As a digital work is geographically disconnected and cover worldwide in a **global gig economy** named also as the **planetary labor market** by Graham & Amir Anwar (2019). Even if the digital transformation "affects everyone to some extent" (Larsson & Teigland, 2020) we focus on e-commerce cluster skills only for the purpose of labor market transparency.

Research methodology

The levels of education and fields of education are two main cross-classification variables provided by the International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED, 2011) belonging to the United Nations International Family of Economic and Social Classifications, so ISCED is the global "reference classification for organizing educational programs and related qualifications by education levels and fields" (UNESCO Institute for Statistics, 2012, p. 6).

We build 120 variables detailed in the Matrix of education as a result of composing the field component of 15 fields (Table 2) and the education level component (Table 3). We will consider the education matrix reduced at two dimensions: field and level of education.

UNESCO Institute of Statistics (2014) defines the fields of education and training and the one related to the e-commerce definition and activity. Starting from previous selections (Dima, Maassen, & Mehmanpazir, 2020; Dima & Maassen, 2018; Gellweiler, 2020) we built a list of 14 fields (see Table 1). The fields are described by main characteristics: broad field, narrow field and detailed field, our interest being focused on the detailed field.

Broad field	Narrow field	Detailed field				
04 Business,	041 Business and	0411 Accounting and taxation				
administration and law	administration	0412 Finance, banking and insurance				
		0413 Management and administration				
		0414 Marketing and advertising 0415 Secretarial and office work				
		0416 Wholesale and retail sales				
		0417 Work skills				
05 Natural sciences,	054 Mathematics	0541 Mathematics				
mathematics and statistics	and statistics	0542 Statistics				
06 Information and	061 Information	0610 Information and Communication				
Communication	and	Technologies not further defined				

Table 1. E-commerce fields of education and training selection

Technologies (ICTs)	Communication	0611 Computer use							
	Technologies (ICTs)	0612 Database and network design and administration							
		0613 Software and applications developmer and analysis							
07 Engineering, manufacturing and construction	071 Engineering and engineering trades	0714 Electronics and automation							

UNESCO Institute for Statistics, 2014

The data used as the first set of variables for the model are the share of graduates by the field of education in the fields compatible with e-commerce, the indicator educ_uoe_grad03 from Eurostat with the structure detailed in the Table2.

Table 2. E- commerce field of education and training variables component (Eurostat -Distribution of graduates at education level and program orientation by sex and field of education [educ_uoe_grad03])

No	Variable	ISCED F-13	Share
	Code		
1	F0411	Accounting and taxation	X1
2	F0412	Finance, banking and insurance	x ₂
3	F0413	Management and administration	X3
4	F0414	Marketing and advertising	X4
5	F0415	Secretarial and office work	X5
6	F0416	Wholesale and retail sales	X6
7	F0417	Work skills	X7
8	F0541	Mathematics	X8
9	F0542	Statistics	X9
10	F0610	Information and Communication Technologies not further defined	X10
11	F0611	Computer use	X11
12	F0612	Database and network design and administration	X12
13	F0613	Software and applications development and analysis	X ₁₃
14	F0619	Information and Communication Technologies not elsewhere classified	X14
15	F0714	Electronics and automation	X15
x=	$=\sum_{i=1}^{n} xi$	Total	100

Note: codified as F [UNESCO ISCED F -2013] at 4 digits

According to the definitions of ISCED for an educational program, it has to be a coherent set of activities meant to achieve the pre-determined objectives. The participants in an education or training program will gain competencies (knowledge, skills) to make them employable after completion is certified by graduation in the

specific field of activity. The level of education for the graduates reflects through certification the successful completion of the learning objectives or educational tasks. Graduates march the new skill demand for e-commerce after whole two years of entering the labor market in the new jobs created by e-commerce. For the correlation model, the level of education variable component uses the Table 3 codification for the Level of Education ISCED 2011 classification.

Level of Education ISCED 2011 classification
Upper secondary education – vocational
Post-secondary non-tertiary education – vocational
Tertiary education (levels 5-8)
Short-cycle tertiary education
Short-cycle tertiary education - general/academic, sufficient for level completion
Bachelor's or equivalent level
Master's or equivalent level
Doctoral or equivalent level

Table 3. The ISCED 11 levels of education (Eurostat) variables component

Note codified as E_[levelISCED]

The model we are developed considered the share of graduates by the level of education during 2015-2018 in European countries. The graduates' s structure dynamics by the level of education and year of study across the EU27 and other countries is in Appendix 1. The period 2015-2018 reflects the tendency of increasing the shares of higher levels of education for the Eu27 countries and five other European countries (Iceland, Liechtenstein, Norway, Switzerland and the United Kingdom).

The main changes that are confirming the trend to higher-skilled labor for the 32 countries are:

- Positive changes:
 - Short-cycle tertiary education (ISCED 5) increase is of 3.75pp from 14.61% average share in 2015 to 18.37% in 2018;
 - Master's or equivalent level (ISCED 7) increase is of 3.25pp from 19.45% average share in 2015 to 22.7% in 2018;
 - Tertiary education (ISCED 5-8) increase is of 2.61pp from 17.19% average share in 2015 to 19.80% in 2018;
 - Bachelor's or equivalent level (ISCED 6) increase is of 1.61pp from 18.69% average share in 2015 to 20.30% in 2018;
 - Doctoral or equivalent level (ISCED 8) increase is of 0.66pp from 8.84% average share in 2015 to 9.6% in 2018;
- Negative changes:
 - Post-secondary non-tertiary education vocational (ISCED 4-5) decrease is of 3.01pp from 18.18% average share in 2015 to 15.17% in 2018;
 - Upper secondary education vocational (ISCED 3-5) decrease is of 1.22pp from 18.18% average share in 2015 to 16.96% in 2018.

Recently, Eurostat develop a specific methodology for the measurement of ecommerce in the survey on ICT and e-commerce usage in enterprises (Kaminska, 2019). In our opinion the e-commerce increasing importance is visible through the share of the enterprises' turnover on e-commerce (Table 4).

Table 4. Share of enterprises' turnover on e-commerce [ptec]											
TIME	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020					
Ireland	37	35	33	35	34	44					
Belgium	25	29	31	32	33	31					
Czech Republic	30	31	31	29	32	30					
Denmark	20	23	23	23	25	29					
Sweden	19	21	19	24	25	24					
Finland	21	20*	21	21	23	24*					
France	17	17	19	22	22	23					
Hungary	19	16	20	23	24	23					
Slovakia	21	18	22	21	21	21					
United Kingdom	20	19	18	19	21	21					
Portugal	17	14	16	18	19	20					
Spain	14	16	16	17	17	19					
Norway	20	24	21	25	26	19					
Germany	17	14	21	14	15	18					
Slovenia	13	15	16	17	17	18					
Netherlands	13	14	15	15	15	17					
Austria	16	15	14	14	14	17					
Poland	13	14	15	15	18	17					
Estonia	13	15	16	15	14	14					
Croatia	14	14	11	12	12	14					
Lithuania	10	11	13	13	13	14					
Italy	9	9	10	11	12	13					
Romania	8	7	8	9	7	12					
Latvia	7	7	9	6	7	10					
Bulgaria	5	4	5	5	4	6					
Cyprus	6	4	5	4	5	6					
Greece	2	6	4	4	4	4					

 Table 4. Share of enterprises' turnover on e-commerce [ptec]

Note: (*) Musings replaced by trend values for the period 2009-2020 All enterprises, without financial sector, 10 persons employed or more Eurostat

In the last 5 years, for 22 countries from the 27 European countries presented in the Table 4 the share of enterprises' turnover on e-commerce increase was with 3pp from 16% in 2015 at 19% in 2020. The best performer countries had high level of this share Ireland (44%), Belgium (31%), Czech Republic (30%) and Denmark (29%), but in regard to high levels of the change of the share of enterprises' turnover on e-commerce the highest were recorded by Denmark (+9pp), Ireland (+7pp), Belgium (+6pp) and France (+6pp).

Correlations Matrix Model

To answer to the research question, we have to study a potential correlation between the education level and the e-commerce share. The statistical correlation between two variables indicates the existence of linear relationships (X and Y) in the case of Pearson

correlation. This link is called the correlation coefficient and can be described by the characteristics: direction, degree of association and shape. The direction could be positive (high values of X are associated with high values of Y) or negative (High values of X are associated with small values of Y) and the degree of association can take values between -1 and 1.

The Pearson correlation (r) represents "Statistical technique that measures and describes the degree of linear association between two normally distributed continuous quantitative variables" (Bolboacă, 2012). That is why a normality check is mandatory. We applied the Shapiro-Wilk W and the Kolmogorov-Smirnov one-sample test for normality. The Shapiro-Wilk W test states that if the W statistic is significant the normal distribution hypothesis has to be rejected. It is used on a large scale due to his good results compared with other tests (Shapiro, Wilk, & Chen, 1968). The second test Kolmogorov-Smirnov of normality compared with the Shapiro is considering the two variables as being part of one sample testing the "goodness of fit" of the data (Berger & Zhou, 2014).

The results of the normality tests Kolmogorov-Smirnov and Shapiro Wilk indicate that all educational variables reject the normality test. The W statistic is significant for all educational variables (level and field), therefore the hypothesis that the respective distribution is normal should be rejected. Since the normality test was rejected, we had to consider a nonparametric test for correlation (Spearman Rank Order Correlation, Gamma Correlations and Kendall Tau) should be checked.

We apply the Spearman test while there is no requirement of normality and for linearity. This test could be applied for any type of variable while the assumptions are respected: to be "interval or ratio level or ordinal and monotonically related" (statstutor.ac.uk) or, in other words the relationship among the two pairs of variables has a "direction" (Bishara & Hittner, 2012).

According to Bolboacă (2012) the Spearman correlation coefficient is different than Pearson correlation: if Spearman correlation=1 then Pearson correlation =0,88. This property makes Spearman correlation weaker than Pearson correlation, covering (\sim 90%).

There are two methods to calculate Spearman's correlation depending on whether: (1) your data does not have tied ranks or (2) your data has tied ranks. The Spearman correlation equations are:

$$\rho = 1 - \frac{6\sum d_i^2}{n(n^2 - 1)}$$

(1)

(2)

when there are no tied ranks; where d_i = difference in paired ranks and n = number of cases. The formula to use when there are tied ranks is:

$$\rho = \frac{\sum_i (x_i - \bar{x})(y_i - \bar{y})}{\sqrt{\sum_i (x_i - \bar{x})^2 \sum_i (y_i - \bar{y})^2}}$$

where *i* = paired score.

791

Our model explores the monotonic relationship between the pairs data of education (filed and level) and e-commerce ranks, Spearman $(x_{i,j,t-2,z}; Y_{tz})$ where:

x_i see the Matrix education (filed and level) from the Table 5

Y = Share of enterprises' turnover on e-commerce - % in years

z = 30 total number of countries analyzed

t=6 years = 2015, 2016, 2017, 2018, 2019, 2020 from Eurostat [TIN00110\$DEFAULTVIEW]

t-2=6 years =2013, 2014, 2015, 2016, 2017, 2018 from Eurostat [educ_uoe_grad03])

```
i = 15 fields of education
```

j = 4 level of education

The correlation was calculated with STATISTICA 10 software.

Results

The Spearman ranks coefficients for education (by field and level) with e-commerce across Europe is presented in Table 5. Among the 60 pairs of variables there are 25 significant at 5%. We can say for the 25 Spearman coefficients, marked in red, that there is less than a 5% chance that the strength of the relationship happened by chance if the null hypothesis were true: H_0 : There is no [monotonic] association between education (filed and level) and e-commerce shares.

 Table 5. The Spearman ranks coefficients for education by field and level with e-commerce across Europe (Calculated by authors)

ISCED 11 ISCED F- 13	Short-cycle tertiary education	Bachelor's or equivalent level	Master's or equivalent level	Doctoral or equivalent level		
	ISCED 5	ISCED 6	ISCED 7	ISCED 8		
F0411	-0.072240	-0.402636	-0.125356	-0.162206		
F0412	0.115406	-0.241877	-0.264170	-0.190615		
F0413	-0.210192	-0.300722	-0.341203	-0.378780		
F0414	-0.022684	-0.113347	0.023281	-0.158510		
F0415	-0.219399	0.179990	-0.171789			
F0416	0.084474	0.167955	-0.112220	-0.072902		
F0417	0.247875	-0.126091	-0.137178	0.012691		
F0541	0.179516	-0.335244	-0.096544	-0.097606		
F0542	0.082464	-0.225551	0.154576	0.137099		
F0610	-0.012533	0.015873	-0.016719	0.016812		
F0611	0.379329	0.172595	0.022741	0.221721		
F0612	-0.011561	-0.212873	-0.208187	-0.158134		
F0613	-0.124784	-0.206360	-0.180249	-0.237860		

F0619	0.003873	0.019595	0.070911	-0.002860
F0714	-0.129210	-0.319435	-0.100530	-0.262369

Legend: negative direction of correlation

positive direction of correlation

0.00-0.19 "very weak" strenght of correlation

0.20-0.39 "weak" strenght of correlation

0.40-0.59 "moderate" strenght of correlation

The strength of Spearman correlation is strongly differentiated by the level of education. They are:

- 6 positive relationships from which 3 *very weak* and 3 *weak*;
- 19 negative relationships from which 1 *moderate*, 15 *weak* and 3 *very weak*.

For *ISCED 6, bachelor degree,* there are 11 significant relationships from which: 8 negative and 3 positive relationships:

- The graduates share during the period 2013-2018 from F0411 Accounting and taxation at ISCED 6 level the higher rank in graduation the lower rank in e-commerce, have a *moderate negative relationship* in the last 5 years of e-commerce, respectively in 2015-2020;
- The graduates share during the period 2013-2018 from
 - F0412 Finance, banking and insurance
 - F0413 Management and administration
 - F0541 Mathematics
 - F0542 Statistics
 - F0612 Database and network design and administration
 - F0613 Software and applications development and analysis
 - F0714 Electronics and automation

have a *weak negative relationship* in the last 5 years of e-commerce, respectively in 2015-2020;

- The graduates share during the period 2013-2018 from
 - F0415 Secretarial and office work
 - F0416 Wholesale and retail sales
 - F0611 Computer use

have a *very weak positive relationship* in the last 5 years of e-commerce, respectively in 2015-2020.

For *ISCED 7, master degree,* there are 5 significant relationships all of them negative:

- The graduates share during the period 2013-2018 from
 - F0412 Finance, banking and insurance
 - F0413 Management and administration
 - F0612 Database and network design and administration

have a *weak negative relationship* in the last 5 years of e-commerce, respectively in 2015-2020;

• The graduates share during the period 2013-2018 from

F0415 Secretarial and office work at ISCED 7 level

F0613 Software and applications development and analysis

the higher rank in graduation the lower rank in e-commerce, have a *very weak negative relationship* in the last 5 years of e-commerce, respectively in 2015-2020.

For *ISCED 8, doctoral degree*, there are 5 significant relationships from which: 4 negative and 1 positive relationships:

- The graduates share during the period 2013-2018 from
 - F0413 Management and administration
 - F0613 Software and applications development and analysis
 - F0714 Electronics and automation

have a *weak negative relationship* in the last 5 years of e-commerce, respectively in 2015-2020;

- The graduates share during the period 2013-2018 from F0412 Finance, banking and insurance at ISCED 8 level the higher rank in graduation the lower rank in e-commerce, have a *very weak negative relationship* in the last 5 years of e-commerce, respectively in 2015-2020;
- The graduates share during the period 2013-2018 from

F0611 Computer use

have a *weak positive relationship* in the last 5 years of e-commerce, respectively in 2015-2020.

For *ISCED 5, Short term tertiary education,* are 4 significant relationships from which: 2 negative and 2 positive relationships:

• The graduates share during the period 2013-2018 from

F0413 Management and administration

F0415 Secretarial and office work

have a *weak negative relationship* in the last 5 years of e-commerce, respectively in 2015-2020;

• The graduates share during the period 2013-2018 from

F0417 Work skills

F0611 Computer use

have a *weak positive relationship* in the last 5 years of e-commerce, respectively in 2015-2020.

Table 6. The correlation Matrix of Education by fields and levels with e-commerce acrossEurope (Calculated by authors)

E6 F0411 E6 F0412 E7 F0412 E8 F0412 E5 F0413 E6_F0413 E7_F0413 E8_F0413 E5 F0415 E6 F0415 E7 F0415 E6_F0416 E5 F0417 E6 F0541 E6_F0542 E6 F0611 E8 F0611 E5 F0611 E6_F0612 E7_F0612 E6_F0613 E7_F0613 E8_F0613 E6_F0714 E8_F0714

Strategica. Shaping the Future of Business and Economy

Legend: EX_F0000 negative moderate EX_F0000 negative weak EX_F0000 negative very weak EX_F0000 positive weak EX_F0000 positive very weak

The correlations matrix shows that only some fields of education from the expected are related with the e-commerce evolution.

I. *Relatively weak positive relationship with e-commerce* – we appreciate this fact as the indicator for the presence of the tendency of increasing the demand by e-commerce for: Weak intensity F0611 Computer use for ISCED 5, 6 and 8 and with very weak intensity for the ISCED 6; Weak intensity for F0417 Work skills for ISCED 5 and Very weak intensity for F0415 Secretarial and office work and F0416 Wholesale and retail sales for ISECD 6.

II. *Relatively weak negative relationship with e-commerce* – this reflects the tendency of decreasing the demand by e-commerce for: Moderate intensity F0411 Accounting and taxation at ISCED 6 level; Weak intensity F0413 Management and administration regardless the ISCED level; Weak intensity F0412 Finance, banking and insurance and F0613 Software and applications development and analysis for the ISCED 6, 7 and 8 weak intensity for F0415 Secretarial and office work ISCED 5 and 7, F0612 Database and network design and administration ISCED 6 and 7 and F0714 Electronics and automation ISCED 6 and 8.

III. *No relationship with e-commerce* regardless the level for F0414 Marketing and advertising; F0610 Information and Communication Technologies not further defined; F0619 Information and Communication Technologies not elsewhere classified.

Conclusions

The F0611 Computer use, regardless the ISCED level of education (even if ISCED 7 is an exception) has a positive relationship with e-commerce. The highest share of graduates for e-commerce looks to have the ISCED 6 level of education with certification in the fields F0415 Secretarial and office work and F0416 Wholesale and retail sales. For these sectors the graduates present occupation mobility higher propensity in the cluster of e-commerce. It looks that the F0611 Computer use field cover the full educational trajectory for all educational levels from ISCED 5 to ISCED 8. We appreciate that the absence of the strong and very strong correlation between the graduates share and the e-commerce field could be question mark of the compatibility of the programs with the emerging activities. Nevertheless, our analysis is giving a hint of the need of educational programs related with the e-commerce (on a growing trend) like F0611 Computer use, F0415 Secretarial and office work, F0416 Wholesale and retail sale and 0417 Work skills.

At the same time the positive correlations highlighted the growing trends for ISCED 5 and 6 and 8 for F0611 Computer use. The first two are addressing the needs of use the technology, since the positive correlation for F0611 Computer use ISCED 8 address the high skilled need in developing products for e-commerce (on-line shops, orders, tracking delivery, payment etc.)

While the progress of technology increases exponentially, the learning rate of human capital is left behind. The new paradigm of learning in the digital transformation perspective changes its weight center from the creation of technology towards the use of technology. Digital transformation is possible when technology is the primary tool to create new technology.

E-commerce demand skills design needs at least two innovative dimensions to develop: the **digital transformation core skills** and **the global gig economy**. The "digital transformation requires the organization to deal better with change overall, essentially making change a core competency as the enterprise becomes customerdriven end-to-end." (Bloomberg, 2018) e-commerce occupation belongs to the digital planetary labor market and its skills have a global occupational mobility. The process to define and create e-commerce skills is **an iterative process** (Larsson & Teigland, 2020)



Acknowledgements

This work support by a grant from the Romanian Ministry of Research and Innovation, Program NUCLEU, 2019-2022, project no: Structural changes in the labor market and innovative change response policies, code PN 19_13_01_02.

References

airfocus. (2021). What Is Digital Transformation? Definition and Examples. Digital Transformation. <u>https://airfocus.com/glossary/what-is-digital-transformation/</u>

- Berger, V. W., & Zhou, Y. (2014). Kolmogorov–Smirnov test: Overview. Wiley statsref: Statistics reference online. This article was originally published online in 2005 in Encyclopedia of Statistics in Behavioral Science, John Wiley & Sons.
- Bishara, A. J., & Hittner, J. B. (2012). Testing the significance of a correlation with nonnormal data: Comparison of Pearson, Spearman, transformation, and resampling approaches. *Psychological Methods*, 17(3), 399–417. <u>https://doi.org/10.1037/a0028087</u>
- Bloomberg, J. (2018). Digitization, Digitalization, And Digital Transformation: Confuse Them At Your Peril. *Forbes*. https://www.forbes.com/sites/jasonbloomberg/2018/04/29/digitization_

<u>digitalization-and-digital-transformation-confuse-them-at-your-peril/</u> Bolboacă, S. D. (2012). Corelația și regresia liniară. 30.

- http://sorana.academicdirect.ro/pages/doc/MV2012/MVRom06.pdf
- De Propris, L., & Bailey, D. (Eds.) (2020). *Industry 4.0 and Regional Transformations* (1st ed.). Routledge. <u>https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429057984</u>
- Dima, A. M., & Maassen, M. A. (2018). From Waterfall to Agile software: Development models in the IT sector, 2006 to 2018. Impacts on company management. *Journal of International Studies*, 11(2), 315–325. <u>https://www.ceeol.com/search/article-detail?id=718102</u>
- Dima, A. M., Maassen, M. A., & Mehmanpazir, B. (2020). Perspectives of Online Education in the Context of the COVID-19 Pandemic Crisis. In *Proceedings of the International Conference* on Economics and Social Sciences (pp. 381–397). Sciendo. https://doi.org/10.2478/9788395815072-041
- Foot, A. (2020, May 15). What are the Biggest Online Marketplaces in the World? | eDesk. *The Ultimate ECommerce Blog for Online Sellers | EDesk.* https://blog.edesk.com/resources/biggest-online-marketplaces-in-the-world/
- Gellweiler, C. (2020). Types of IT Architects: A Content Analysis on Tasks and Skills. *Journal of Theoretical and Applied Electronic Commerce Research*, *15*(2), 0–0. https://doi.org/10.4067/S0718-18762020000200103
- Graham, M., & Anwar, M. A. (2019). The global gig economy: Towards a planetary labour market? First Monday. <u>https://doi.org/10.5210/fm.v24i4.9913</u>
- Hamiton, V. (2012). Career Pathway and Cluster Skill Development: Promising Models from the United States (OECD Local Economic and Employment Development (LEED) Working Papers No. 2012/14.
- OECD. (2012). Local Economic and Employment Development (LEED) Working Papers (Vol. 2012/14). <u>https://doi.org/10.1787/5k94g1s6f7td-en</u>
- Kaminska, M. (2019). Measurement of e-commerce in the Eurostat survey on ICT usage and e-commerce in enterprises. UNCTAD, European Commission, Eurostat, Unit G4 Innovation and digitalization, 19. <u>https://unctad.org/system/files/non-official-document/tdb_ede_wg2019p06_Kaminska.pdf</u>
- Li, C. (2021, March 25). E-commerce to Account for Half the Growth in Global Retail.... Euromonitor. <u>https://www.euromonitor.com/article/e-commerce-to-account-for-half-the-growth-in-global-retail-by-2025</u>
- McAuliffe, W. (2020). eCommerce Customer Experience: How to Create Great Experiences in 2021 and Beyond. <u>https://www.bloomreach.com/en/blog/2020/08/ecommerce-customer-experience.html</u>
- Shapiro, S. S., Wilk, M. B., & Chen, H. J. (1968). A comparative study of various tests for normality. Journal of the American Statistical Association, 63(324), 1343-1372
- UNESCO Institute for Statistics. (2012). International standard classification of education: ISCED 2011. UNESCO Institute for Statistics.

http://www.uis.unesco.org/Education/Documents/isced-2011-en.pdf

UNESCO Institute for Statistics. (2014). ISCED Fields of education and training 2013 (ISCED-F 2013): Manual to accompany the International Standard Classification of Education 2011. UNESCO Institute for Statistics. <u>https://doi.org/10.15220/978-92-9189-150-4-en</u>

Appendix 1

The share of graduates by education level in total graduates during 2015-2018 (Eurostat - Distribution of graduates at education level and program orientation by sex and field of education [educ_uoe_grad03])

educatio				<u>1C</u>		be	<u>-8</u>	ra		3		_	_		_								_	_			_	_					_		
alent		7 2018		4 8.6	1 16.7	3 11.4	0 0	3 8.5	5 15.6	8	3 13.4	0 0	5 16.7	5 12.4	0 0	2 17.5	3 14.7	3 12.8	3 26	9 5.5	7 11.4	0	4 3.8	2	3 15.2	5 13.1	0 6	3 14.1	5 10	3 11.8	2 3.3	0	9 5.9	9 11.5	2 12.3
Doctoral or equivalent level	ISCED 8	2017		6.4	15.1	t 12.8)	7 8.8	3 11.6	1 8.5	3 12.3)	5 12.5	3 16.5)	14.2	23.8	3 15.8	t 28.3	3 4.9	1 5.7	0	4.4	7 8.2	4 13	13.6	6.9	11.8	9.5	11.8	3.2	0	7.7.9	12.9	1 12
toralor le	ISC	2016		7.2	13.1	10.4	0	8.7	11.3	8.1	11.8	0	6	12.8	0	18.1	19.2	13.3	23.4	5.3	11.1	0	4.4	7.7	13.4	10	0	13.1	9.9	12.1	2.8	0	7.7	13.1	12.1
Doc		2015		~	15.8	12.8	0	9.2	13	10	11.9	0	10.1	0	0	13	13.9	15.8	33.7	6.3	3.3	0	5.2	8.6	16.5	13.1	13	12.5	10.3	12.4	5	0	5.8	12.9	0
alent		2018		17.1	36.2	18.2	14.6	10.4	23.3	30.7	30.2	15.7	18.6	24.5	13.8	23.3	28.3	19.7	51	20.5	38.2	25.6	23	24	22.1	19	0	20.3	8.8	6.8	27	58	18.6	23.4	20.5
or equiv level	ISCED 7	2017		20.5	36.6	16.2	14.2	9.9	24.1	28.3	28.6	14.8	20.1	11.1	13.3	18.9	28.3	21.5	56.3	22.5	33	25.5	22.3	25.9	20.7	20.5	15.3	19.6	8.4	6.6	29.5	55.1	20.6	22.7	20.6
Master's or equivalent level	ISC	2016		19.9	39.8	18.4	14.8	10	23.5	28.8	33.3	13.6	16.9	10.5	12.8	25.8	26.1	21.7	55.7	21.1	19.2	25.1	20	26.5	19.9	20.8	0	17.9	9.3	6.9	27.2	0	18.7	22.2	20.6
		2015		18.9	90.6	17	8	10	21	31.1	35.1	5 15.8	17.6	8	3 11.7	27.8	ł 29.7	33.2	45.2	5 23.1	25	24.6	19.8	26.7	7 18.9	20.5	12.4	18.4	8.6	6.9	26.2	0	ł 17.9	3 22.4	F O
Bachelor's or equivalent level		2018		15.1	38.6	14.7	15.9	3 12.2	20.3	23.4	3 24.6	3 18.6	19	5 28.8	16.8	23.5	26.4	26.9	27.3	30.6	27.6	9 25.6	ł 14.9	3 25.5	25.7	ł 26.2	1	21.7	8.6	7.1	11.9	1.5	23.4	32.3	15.4
s or equi level	ISCED 6	2017		14.9	ł 40	14.9	5 14.3	11.8	23.9	3 20.6	ł 24.8	18.8	19	10.6	15.3	26.1	29.9	9 28.6	5 22.5	3 28.6	27.5	25.9	14	25.8	25	ł 25.4	11	20.9	7.8	6.9	12.9	17.8	24.2	32.1	15.3
ielor's (ISC	2016		15	39.4	20.5	13.6	13.7	ł 24.1	19.8	5 25.4	18.3	17.3	0 10.5	15.3	ł 22.5	3 28.7	29.9	26	28.3	ł 21.6	25.7	12.7	26.1	5 23.7	25.4	0	3 21.2	0.	6.3	3 13.2	0	3 20.5	32.7	0 14.8
Bacł		2015		12.5	39	21.9	10.4	13.7	24.4	18.9	26.5	19.7	17.8	0	12	24	28.3	30.2	20.4	30.1	27.4	25	12	25.1	22.6	27.1	0.	21.8	8.2	6.6	10.3	0	3 20.8	32	
lary nic, vel		2.018			0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0 0	0 0	0	0	0	0	0	59.7	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	t 17.3	0	0	1.8	0	3 12.3
Short-cycle tertiary education - general/academic, sufficient for level completion	ISCED 544	2017	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	43	0	0	0	0	0	0	0 C	0	19.4	0	0	4.2	0	11.8
ort-cy educ eneral/ ufficier com	ISCE	2016		0	0	0	0	0	0 0	0	0	0	0	0	0 0	0	0	0	0	0 0	91.7	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	17.2	0	0	4.1	0	0 11.8
SI s		2015		0	0			0	0		0	0	0				-	0			59.5	0		0		Ŭ	0	0	0	13.9	Ŭ	0	2.3		
ary		2018		0	0	0	52.1	0	0	20.3	0	32.9	43.8	10	42	36.6	27	0	38.4	48.1	33.3	52.8	3.9	0	38.6	0	0	11.4	0	45.2	22.3	0	10.6	0	0
Short-cycle tertiary education	ISCED 5	2017	39.4	0	0	0	51.5	0	0	19.7	0	33	6 48.5	0	23.5	40.7	29.1	0	43	47.1	33.3	55.5	4.1	0	40.8	0	13.2	5 12.1	0	41.9	26.3	0	6 8	0	8.6
10rt-cy edu	ISI	2016	37.8	0	0	0	3 49.8	0	0	7 20.3	0	33.2	5 45	5.9	0 23.5	33.6	1 37.2	0	9.8	3 43	3 21.7	3 59.5	5 3.8	0	0 85.9	0	+	7 14.6	0	43.1	8.5	0	3 7.6	0 3.2	0
		2015					51.3	0	8	5 18.7	9	34.5	ł 47.6	2		37.5	36.1	0	8.9	43.3	43.8	65.3	4.6	~			12.4	11.7		41.9	7 16.3	0	8.3		0
Tertiary education (levels 5-8)		2018		3 15.1	36.9	3 16	19.7	11.3	21.3	24.6	26	0	ł 25.4	26.7	15.4	24.8	27.1	24.9	38.8	28	31.4	0	13.6	24.8	ł 24.8	ł 23.2	0	20.6	8.7	11.6	3 16.7	29.5	20.8	ł 28.8	8
1 ucation 5-8)	ISCED 5-8	2017		2 16.3	3 37.8	9 15.3	9 18.5	9 10.9	5 23.7	2 22.2	3 25.4	0	5 27.4	5 11	0 14	2 23.6	3 29.2	5 26.6	3 39.8	9 27.2	3 29.	0	1 13.3	3 25.7	5 24	4 23.4	0 12.3	9 20	1 8.1	1 10.9	2 17.8	30.1	9 21.7	5 28.4	0 15.8
ary edi	ISC	5 2016		5 16.2	1 38.8	3 19	5 17.9	1 11.9	1 23.6	3 22	7 26.8	0	9 24.5	0 10.6	0	3 25.2	1 29.8	3 27.6	7 35.8	3 25.9	9 20.8	0	5 12.1	4 26.3	3 22.5	9 23.4		5 19	5 9.1	3 11	17.	0	3 19	4 28.6	0
Terti		3 2015		1 14.5	7 39.1	0 19.3	2 14.6	9 12.1	3 23.1	3 21.8	3 27.	-	7 25.9	0	0	0 27.3	5 30.1	2 28.3	9 31.7	28.3	4 29	0	5 11.5	4 25.4	4 21.3	2 23.9	0 10.7	3 19.6	8.5	2 11.3	1 15.2	0	5 18.8	0 28.4	0
-uou - uoi		7 2018	_	2 2.1	7 17.7	0	8 66.2	6 25.9	8 50.8	4	3 14.8	4 40.9	2 0.7	0	0	4	8 18.5	9 29.2	5 5.9	3 26.2	0 9.4	0	1	4 11.4	3 34.4	7 9.2	0	7 12.3	9 46.8	3 20.2	19 23.1	0	5 26	0	0
second ary ary educat vocational	ISCED 4-5	6 2017		2.5	7 46.7	0	3 87.8	9 26.6	6 39.8	5 4.	1 15.3	1 45.4	1 0.2	0	0	5 28.4	5 16.8	8 30.9	3 4.5	3 29.3	4	0	8 7.1	2 15.4	27 17.3	9.7	0	14 13.7	3 53.9	3 24.3		0	1 28.5	0	0
Post-second ary non- tertiary education - vocational	ISC	5 2016			1 40.7	0	9 93.3	7 25.9	1 28.6	0 12.5	4 16.1	4 47.1	8	0	0	8 54.5	9 15.5	6 28.8	3	8 29.3	2 37.4	0	9 6.8	6 15.2		2	0		9 55.3	7 27.3	3 13.2	0	9 28.1	0	0
P.		8 2015		9 2.2	9 51	_	6 86.9	3 26.7	5 24.1	4	3 17.4	3 40.4	0 1.8	13	0	2 38.8	4 13.9	8 28.6	8	1 31.8	1 29.2	2	9 7.9	3 16.6	3 25.8	5 9.2	0	8 14.8	3 53.9	2 28.7	7 13.3	9	7 33.9		0
ary tional		7 2018		2 13.9	3 30.9	5 12.1	8 26.6	5 37.3	8 22.5	0 2.4	6 19.3	2 25.3	6 20		0	8 8.2	3 20.4	8 20.8	9 12.8	5 12.1	1 20.1	2 23.2	8 19.9	3 29.3	6 28.3	5 6.5	4	2 21.8	5 14.3	7 6.2	8 3.7	4 38.6	1 12.7	5 17.9	0
econd:	ISCED 3-5	2016 2017	7 23.8	4 14.2	4 29.3	3 1	4 24.8	9 37.5	3 19.8	9	4 26.6	1 25.2	7 19.6	3 12.7	7 30	5 8.8	4 23.3	9 21.8	7 37.9	2 15.5	1 24.1	5 24.2	5 19.8	5 29.3	30.6	1 6.5	0 10.4	9 22.	2 13.5	5.	3.8	9 34.4	3 13.1	1 18.5	0
Upp er seconda education - vocat	ISC.	2014	5 23.7		4 30.4	5 15.3	7 23.4	9 37.9	7 15.8	0 12.6	1 36.4	9 24.1	3 19.7	0 12.8	6 28.7	3 7.5	6 23.4	9 19	5 34.7	9 12.2	5 21	5 24.6	8 19.6	6 31.5	8 30.3	9 6.1	1	3 21.9	7 12.2	5 5.8	4 3.3	8 39	5 12.8	8 18.1	0
edi		2015	23.5	13.8	31.4	15	24.7	37.9	14.7		33.1	23.9	19.3)	28.6	5.3	23.6	19	15	12.9	25.5	24.5	19.8	29.6	28.8	6.9	11	24.3	11.7	5.5	2.4	37.8	12.5	18	
ISCED11			EU27(2020)	Belgium	Bulgaria	Czechia	Denmark	Germany	Estonia	Ireland	Greece	Spain	France	Croatia	Italy	Cyprus	Latvia	Lithuania	Luxembourg	Hungary	Malta	Netherlands	Austria	Poland	Portugal	Romania	Slovenia	Slovakia	Finland	Sweden	Iceland	Liechtenstein	Norway	Switzerland	United Kingdom

Appendix 2

Spearman Rank Order Correlations (ISCED5).MD pairwise deleted. Marked correlations are significant at p <.05000 (Calculated by authors)

		Valid	Spearman	t(N-2)	p-value
ptec	& E5_F0411	110	-0.072240	-0.75271	0.453265
ptec	& E5_F0412	110	0.115406	1.20741	0.229913
ptec	& E5_F0413	110	-0.210192	-2.23429	0.027523
ptec	& E5_F0414	110	-0.022684	-0.23580	0.814036
ptec	& E5_F0415	110	-0.219399	-2.33701	0.021283
ptec	& E5_F0416	110	0.084474	0.88103	0.380260
ptec	& E5_F0417	110	0.247875	2.65897	0.009030
ptec	& E5_F0541	110	0.179516	1.89640	0.060580
ptec	& E5_F0542	110	0.082464	0.85991	0.391741
ptec	& E5_F0610	110	-0.012533	-0.13025	0.896607
ptec	& E5_F0611	110	0.379329	4.26053	0.000044
ptec	& E5_F0612	110	-0.011561	-0.12015	0.904589
ptec	& E5_F0613	110	-0.124784	-1.30701	0.193985
ptec	& E5_F0619	110	0.003873	0.04025	0.967970
ptec	& E5_F0714	110	-0.129210	-1.35414	0.178518

Spearman Rank Order Correlations (ISCED 6). MD pairwise deleted. Marked correlations are significant at p <.05000 (Calculated by authors)

		Valid	Spearman	t(N-2)	p-value
ptec	& E6_F0411	154	-0.402636	-5.42303	0.000000
ptec	& E6_F0412	154	-0.241877	-3.07331	0.002510
ptec	& E6_F0413	154	-0.300722	-3.88750	0.000151
ptec	& E6_F0414	154	-0.113347	-1.40650	0.161616
ptec	& E6_F0415	154	0.179990	2.25590	0.025504
ptec	& E6_F0416	154	0.167955	2.10052	0.037334
ptec	& E6_F0417	154	-0.126091	-1.56706	0.119180
ptec	& E6_F0541	154	-0.335244	-4.38703	0.000021
ptec	& E6_F0542	154	-0.225551	-2.85433	0.004915
ptec	& E6_F0610	154	0.015873	0.19572	0.845093
ptec	& E6_F0611	154	0.172595	2.16032	0.032315
ptec	& E6_F0612	154	-0.212873	-2.68604	0.008035
ptec	& E6_F0613	154	-0.206360	-2.60014	0.010238
ptec	& E6_F0619	154	0.019595	0.24163	0.809392
ptec	& E6_F0714	154	-0.319435	-4.15601	0.000054

Marked correlations are significant at p <.05000 (Calculated by auth													
		Valid	Spearman	t(N-2)	p-value								
ptec	& E7_F0411	154	-0.125356	-1.55778	0.121366								
ptec	& E7_F0412	154	-0.264170	-3.37687	0.000931								
ptec	& E7_F0413	154	-0.341203	-4.47519	0.000015								
ptec	& E7_F0414	154	0.023281	0.28711	0.774421								
ptec	& E7_F0415	154	-0.171789	-2.14992	0.033143								
ptec	& E7_F0416	154	-0.112220	-1.39233	0.165856								
ptec	& E7_F0417	154	-0.137178	-1.70738	0.089793								
ptec	& E7_F0541	154	-0.096544	-1.19587	0.233611								
ptec	& E7_F0542	154	0.154576	1.92892	0.055604								
ptec	& E7_F0610	154	-0.016719	-0.20615	0.836948								
ptec	& E7_F0611	154	0.022741	0.28044	0.779521								
ptec	& E7_F0612	154	-0.208187	-2.62420	0.009572								
ptec	& E7_F0613	154	-0.180249	-2.25926	0.025289								
ptec	& E7_F0619	154	0.070911	0.87645	0.382166								
ptec	& E7_F0714	154	-0.100530	-1.24573	0.214779								

Spearman Rank Order Correlations (ISCED7) MD pairwise deleted. Marked correlations are significant at p <.05000 (Calculated by authors)

Correlations (ISCED5) Marked in red correlations are significant at p < .05000 (Calculated by authors)

	-	Valid	Spearman	t(N-2)	p-value
ptec	& E8_F0411	134	-0.162206	-1.88861	0.061138
ptec	& E8_F0412	134	-0.190615	-2.23091	0.027375
ptec	& E8_F0413	134	-0.378780	-4.70223	0.000006
ptec	& E8_F0414	134	-0.158510	-1.84446	0.067358
ptec	& E8_F0415	134			
ptec	& E8_F0416	134	-0.072902	-0.83981	0.402533
ptec	& E8_F0417	134	0.012691	0.14582	0.884289
ptec	& E8_F0541	134	-0.097606	-1.12679	0.261875
ptec	& E8_F0542	134	0.137099	1.59016	0.114190
ptec	& E8_F0610	134	0.016812	0.19318	0.847115
ptec	& E8_F0611	134	0.221721	2.61240	0.010033
ptec	& E8_F0612	134	-0.158134	-1.83997	0.068019
ptec	& E8_F0613	134	-0.237860	-2.81356	0.005649
ptec	& E8_F0619	134	-0.002860	-0.03286	0.973838
ptec	& E8_F0714	134	-0.262369	-3.12383	0.002195